

# **THE PHILOSOPHY OF WAḤDAH AL-WUJŪD IN THE WAḤDAH AL-WUJŪD FĪ BAYĀN AL- MA'RIFAH MIN KULL BAYĀN AL-MUḤAQQIQĪN MANUSCRIPT: A STUDY OF NUSANTARA SUFI TRADITIONS**

**Pradibyo Herdiansyah<sup>1</sup>, Amiroh Nichayatun Munir Azizah<sup>2</sup>,  
M Napis Djuaeni<sup>3</sup>, Andi Ahmad Syauqi Nafis<sup>4</sup>,  
Ahmad Hashif Ulwan<sup>5</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>*KH. Mukhtar Syafaat University, Banyuwangi, East Java, Indonesia*

<sup>2,4</sup>*Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University Jakarta, Indonesia*

<sup>3</sup>*State Islamic College of Majene, West Sulawesi, Indonesia*

<sup>5</sup>*University of Ez-Zitouna, Tunisia*

\*Corresponding e-mail: [pradibyo@iaida.ac.id](mailto:pradibyo@iaida.ac.id)

Received: 07-05-2025 | Revised: 07-10-2025 | Accepted: 31-12-2025

## **ABSTRACT**

This study examines the philosophical construction of Waḥdah al-Wujūd in the manuscript *Waḥdah al-Wujūd fī Bayān al-Ma'rifah min Kull Bayān al-Muḥaqqiqīn* attributed to Muḥammad Makkī, a text that has received little scholarly attention despite its relevance to the development of nineteenth-century Nusantara Sufi thought. Existing research on Wujūdīyyah in the archipelago has focused primarily on seventeenth-century figures such as Hamzah Fansuri and Abdurrauf Singkel, leaving a gap in understanding how later intellectual networks, particularly in Buton, adapted and transformed these metaphysical ideas. This study aims to fill that gap by analyzing the manuscript's ontological framework and its contribution to the local articulation of Sufi philosophy. The research employs qualitative content analysis using primary data from the DREAMSEA digital manuscript DS 0010 00100, supported by comparative readings of Fansuri's *Sharab al-ʿAshiqīn* and Singkel's *Tanbīh al-Māshī*. Philological methods, including transcription, textual description, and thematic coding, were used to identify key metaphysical concepts. The findings show three major points. First, Makkī introduces a distinctive "shadow ontology" that maps divine manifestation onto the human microcosm. Second, he offers a theological distinction between *Allāh* and *Ilāh* that reframes debates on transcendence and immanence. Third, the manuscript demonstrates a reconciliatory form of Wujūdīyyah that

integrates Fansuri's metaphysics with Singkel's cautionary theological stance. These insights highlight the manuscript's role in shaping Butonese Sufi discourse and expanding the intellectual genealogy of Wujūdiyyah in the region. The study concludes that Muḥammad Makkī's work represents a significant yet overlooked link in the evolution of Nusantara philosophical Sufism.

**Keywords:** Islamic manuscripts, Nusantara Sufi traditions, *Waḥdah al-Wujūd* philosophy

### ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini mengkaji konstruksi filosofis *Waḥdah al-Wujūd* dalam manuskrip *Waḥdah al-Wujūd fī Bayān al-Ma'rifah min Kull Bayān al-Muḥaqqiqīn* yang dikaitkan dengan Muḥammad Makkī, sebuah teks yang jarang dibahas meskipun memiliki relevansi penting bagi perkembangan pemikiran tasawuf Nusantara pada abad ke-19. Kajian sebelumnya mengenai Wujūdiyyah di Nusantara terutama berfokus pada tokoh abad ke-17 seperti Hamzah Fansuri dan Abdurrauf Singkel, sehingga menyisakan kesenjangan terkait bagaimana jaringan intelektual yang lebih akhir, khususnya di Buton, mengadaptasi dan mentransformasikan gagasan metafisik tersebut. Penelitian ini bertujuan mengisi kesenjangan tersebut dengan menganalisis kerangka ontologis manuskrip dan kontribusinya terhadap artikulasi lokal filsafat tasawuf. Penelitian ini menggunakan analisis konten kualitatif dengan data primer berupa manuskrip digital DREAMSEA DS 0010 00100, serta pembacaan komparatif terhadap *Sharab al-Āshiqīn* karya Fansuri dan *Tanbīh al-Māshī* karya Singkel. Metode filologis, termasuk transkripsi, deskripsi tekstual, dan pengodean tematik, digunakan untuk mengidentifikasi konsep-konsep metafisik utama. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan tiga kontribusi utama. Pertama, Makkī memperkenalkan "ontologi bayangan" yang memetakan manifestasi ketuhanan ke dalam mikrokosmos manusia. Kedua, ia menawarkan pembedaan teologis antara Allāh dan Ilāh yang memperluas diskusi tentang transendensi dan immanensi. Ketiga, manuskrip ini menampilkan bentuk Wujūdiyyah yang bersifat rekonsiliatif yang mengintegrasikan metafisika Fansuri dengan pendekatan teologis hati-hati ala Singkel. Temuan ini menegaskan peran manuskrip tersebut dalam membentuk wacana tasawuf Buton dan memperluas genealogi intelektual Wujūdiyyah di kawasan ini. Penelitian menyimpulkan bahwa karya Muḥammad Makkī merupakan mata rantai penting yang selama ini terabaikan dalam evolusi tasawuf filosofis Nusantara.

**Kata kunci:** Filsafat *Waḥdah al-Wujūd*, manuskrip Islam, tradisi sufi Nusantara

## INTRODUCTION

While historical narratives of *wahdah al-wujūd* in the Nusantara often focus on the early controversies in Aceh and Java, the intellectual landscape of the Buton Sultanate offers a distinct trajectory of Sufi localization that warrants specific attention. Unlike the theological conflicts observed elsewhere, the mystical philosophy in Buton was uniquely institutionalized into the socio-political fabric, particularly during the era of Sultan Muhammad ‘Aydarūs Qā’im al-Dīn.<sup>1</sup> This period saw the profound integration of Sufi metaphysics into state governance, where the doctrine of *Martabat Tujuh* (Seven Grades of Being) served not only as a spiritual guide but also as the philosophical foundation for the Sultanate’s constitution and social hierarchy. Within this milieu, the manuscript *Wahdah al-Wujūd fī Bayān al-Ma‘rifah min Kull Bayān al-Muḥaqqiqīn* emerges as a product of a vibrant intellectual network, heavily influenced by the convergence of the Khalwatiyah and Sammaniyah orders. Therefore, rather than reiterating general historical disputes, this study situates the manuscript within this specific Butonese context, demonstrating how *Wujūdiyyah* thought was adopted and adapted to support a harmony between the mystical path and political order. The evolution of Sufi thought in the archipelago highlights not only the philosophical underpinnings of *wujūdiyyah* but also the socio-political dynamics that influenced the acceptance and interpretation of these mystical teachings, ultimately leading to significant controversies and conflicts, such as the persecution of Sufi practitioners and the destruction of their works.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> A.C.S. Peacock, “Arabic Manuscripts from Buton, Southeast Sulawesi, and the Literary Activities of Sultan Muḥammad ‘Aydarūs (1824–1851),” *Journal of Islamic Manuscripts* 10, no. 1 (April 2019): 44–83, <https://doi.org/10.1163/1878464X-01001005>; Muhammad Roy Purwanto, “Acculturation among Local Wisdom, Law and Sufism in Forming Martabat Tujuh Enactment of Buton Sultanate,” *International Journal of Humanities and Management Sciences* 4, no. 3 (2016): 288–92.

<sup>2</sup> Fuad Mahbub Siraj et al., “The Existence and the Challenges of Sufi Literature in Indonesia,” *Jurnal Akidah & Pemikiran Islam* 24, no. 1 (June 2022): 243–70, <https://doi.org/10.22452/afkar.vol24no1.7>.

Originating with al-Bustāmī and al-Ḥallāj,<sup>3</sup> the doctrine of *waḥdah al-wujūd* was systematized by Ibn Arabī<sup>4</sup> and subsequently adopted in the archipelago by Hamzah Fansuri and Syamsuddin al-Sumatrani.<sup>5</sup> Their framework relied heavily on the *Martabat Tujuh* (Seven Dignities) concept derived from Burhānpūrī's *Tuhfah al-Mursalāh*, which delineates creation as divine emanations.<sup>6</sup> However, these teachings sparked intense socio-political controversy in the 17th century due to conflicting interpretations.<sup>7</sup> In Aceh, Nūr al-Dīn al-Rānīrī ordered the burning of Wujūdiyyah works and the persecution of adherents, mirroring the earlier execution of Syekh Siti Jenar in Java by the Wali Sanga for his *Manunggaling Kawula Gusti* teachings.<sup>8</sup> Despite this suppression, the philosophical lineage persisted and evolved through the reconciliatory approach of Abdurrauf

---

<sup>3</sup> Syafwan Rozi, "Wacana Sufistik: Tasawuf Falsafi Di Nusasntara Abad XVII M: Analisis Historis Dan Filosofis," *Islam Realitas: Journal of Islamic & Social Studies* 3, no. 2 (December 2017): 163–75, [https://doi.org/10.30983/islam\\_realitas.v3i2.405](https://doi.org/10.30983/islam_realitas.v3i2.405).

<sup>4</sup> Rüdiger Lohlker, "Waḥdat Al-Wujūd as Post-Avicennian Thought: Comparing Writings on the Basmala by Ibn 'Arabī and 'Abd al-Karīm al-Jīlī," *Teosofi: Jurnal Tasawuf Dan Pemikiran Islam* 11, no. 2 (December 2021): 194–215, <https://doi.org/10.15642/teosofi.2021.11.2.194-215>.

<sup>5</sup> For a more detailed explanation of this teaching and some of its dynamics, see Masmedia Pinem, "Ajaran Martabat Tujuh Dalam Naskah Asrar Al-Khafi Karya Syaikh," *Jurnal Lektur Keagamaan* 10, no. 1 (2012): 121–46, <https://doi.org/10.31291/jlk.v10i1.174>; Jajang A. Rohmana, "Diskursus Tasawuf Nusantara Di Mekah: Respons Mukhtār 'Aṭārid Al-Bughūrī Terhadap Ajaran Martabat Tujuh," *Jurnal Lektur Keagamaan* 19, no. 1 (July 2021): 1–36, <https://doi.org/10.31291/jlka.v19i1.923>.

<sup>6</sup> Faudzinaim Badaruddin, "Tuhfah Al-Mursalāh Ila Ruh al-Nabiy as the Source of the Doctrine Seven Grades of Being in the Malay-Indonesian Archipelago," *Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism* 10, no. 1 (April 2021): 59–74, <https://doi.org/10.21580/tos.v10i1.8580>.

<sup>7</sup> Muhammad Afif Anshori, "Kontestasi Tasawuf Sunni Dan Tasawuf Falsafdi Di Nusantara," *Teosofi: Jurnal Tasawuf Dan Pemikiran Islam* 4, no. 2 (September 2014): 309–27, <https://doi.org/10.15642/teosofi.2014.4.2.309-327>.

<sup>8</sup> Muhammad Irfan Riyadi, "Kontroversi Teosofi Islam Jawa Dalam Manuskrip Kapujanggan," *Al-Tahrir: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 13, no. 1 (2013): 21–41, <https://doi.org/10.21154/al-tahrir.v13i1.5>.

Singkel<sup>9</sup> and later Javanese syntheses like Ranggawarsita's *Serat Wirid Hidayat Jati*.<sup>10</sup>

The polemic that occurred in the archipelago in the XVII-XVIII centuries prompted several studies related to the teachings of philosophical Sufism in the archipelago, which were initiated by many Dutch orientalis, including Johan Doorenbos, *De Geschriften van Hamzah Pansoeri* and C.A.A. van Nieuwenhuyze, *Sams' l-din van Pasai*. Meanwhile, Eastern scholars include Syed Naquib Al-Attas in *The Mysticism of Hamzah Fansuri*<sup>12</sup> and Harun Hadiwijono, *Man in the Present Javanese Mysticism*. Moreover, Oman Fathurahman's research on the thoughts of Abdurrauf Singkel, who mediates the controversy over the understanding of wujūdiyyah Hamzah Fansuri and al-Raniri can be a reference for text interpretation in this research.

While foundational scholarship has exhaustively covered 17th-century figures like Hamzah Fansuri and Abdurrauf Singkel, the specific philosophical evolution within the 19th-century Buton tradition remains obscured. This study addresses this critical gap not merely by introducing the WWBMKBM manuscript, but by delineating its unique ontological contributions. The novelty of this research lies in its analysis of Muḥammad Makkī's distinct metaphorical framework, specifically his articulation of *ẓill al-wujūd* (shadow of existence). Unlike earlier texts that primarily focus on the abstract mechanics of emanation, Makkī employs the "shadow" metaphor to bridge the ontological divide, offering a nuanced interpretation of how the material world reflects the Divine Essence without claiming absolute identity. This study, therefore, highlights how

---

<sup>9</sup> Oman Fathurahman, *Tanbīh Al-Māsyī: Menyoal Wahdatul Wujud Kasus Abdurrauf Singkel Di Aceh Abad 17* (Bandung: Mizan, 1999), 21.

<sup>10</sup> Mohamad Abdun Nasir, "Revisiting the Javanese Muslim Slametan: Islam, Local Tradition, Honor and Symbolic Communication," *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* 57, no. 2 (December 2019): 329–58, <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2019.572.329-358>.

<sup>11</sup> Martin Van Bruinessen, "Studies of Sufism and the Sufi Orders in Indonesia," *Die Welt Des Islams* 38, no. 2 (1998): 192–219.

<sup>12</sup> Syed Naquid Al-Attas, *The Mysticism of Hamzah Fansuri* (Kuala Lumpur: University of Malaysia Press, 1970), 382, 474, 520.

Makkī's philosophical dimensions add a sophisticated layer to the Wujūdīyyah discourse, marking a significant evolution in Nusantara Sufi thought distinct from its predecessors.

Muḥammad Makkī (late 19th AD) has never been mentioned among the many Archipelago Sufis mentioned in some of the studies above. At the same time, he has a work that fills Sufism discourses, particularly regarding *wujūdīyyah*. He has a particular characteristic in explaining one of the concepts of Wujūdīyyah, as he mentions the explanation of God's manifestation with a shadowy metaphor:

*Al-Sirr ḡill al-wujūd wa-al-rūḡ ḡill al-dhāt wa-al-qalb ḡill al-ṡifāt wa-al-badan ḡill al-'asmā' wa-al-ḡarakah wa-al-sukūn ḡill al-'af'āl kamā ḡāla-allāḡ ta'ālā kayf madd al-ḡill.*

Sirr – something unseen, refers to the deep level of the heart – is the shadow of Being, the Spirit is the shadow of the Essence, the heart is the shadow of the Attributes, the body is the shadow of the Names, motion, and stillness are the shadow of the Deeds, as Allah says How He widens the shadow.

Muḥammad Makkī explores the fragment of the verse '*kayf madd al-ḡill*' by interpreting the metaphysical classification of spirit, body, and nature. Abdurrauf Singkel also uses this verse in the preamble to the book *Tanbīḡ al-Māsyī* by word *al-ḡamdu lillāḡi 'allaḡi madda al-ḡilla* (All praise be to Allah, who bestows the shadow).<sup>13</sup> Likewise, the word shadow appears in the mystical poem Hamzah Fansuri about the manifestation of God, he said, "Wahdat is called shadows, There, Dalang (Puppeteer) and Wayang (Puppet) were real, His Muḡit (Reach) is complete in all fields, The deliberation there is abysmal."<sup>14</sup>

On another occasion, he gave the meaning of the sentence *tawḡīd lā ilāḡa illāllāḡ*. He said:

<sup>13</sup> Ahmad Rivauzi, "Landasan Filosofis Pemikiran Tasawuf Abdurrauf Singkel Tentang Allah, Manusia, Dan Alam," *Jurnal Theologia* 28, no. 2 (February 2018): 299–328, <https://doi.org/10.21580/teo.2017.28.2.1451>.

<sup>14</sup> Miswari Miswari, Abdul Aziz Dahlan, and Abdul Hadi W.M., "ḡamzah Faṡṡūrī's Contextual Analogies: Wujūdīyya Teaching in Malay 16th Century," *Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism* 11, no. 1 (June 2022): 103–22, <https://doi.org/10.21580/tos.v11i1.11243>.

Isim Jalālah (Allah), which is mentioned after the word ‘Illā does not mean God who has the right to be worshipped, but Allah here means asthma which shows Oneness and He Who is the Creator of nature. Meanwhile, what is meant by the word ‘Ilāh’ is not absolutely ‘worshipped’ because it is a consequence of the word Kun, which is the cause for many worship services.

This meaning differs from previously well-known meanings, such as the meaning explained in the book *Safīnah al-Najā*. In the author’s opinion, this brief meaning by Muhammad Makkī also has implications for a believer’s mystical theological understanding, especially in the concept of *tasybīh* and *tanzīh* Allah, namely alienation, exaltation, and recognition of God’s transcendent nature and comparison, likening, and glory of God’s symbolism, or God’s immanence.<sup>15</sup>

The influence of Syamsuddin al-Sumatrānī found in Buton can be seen from the discovery of the Martabat Tujuh teachings – which is one of the teachings of *Syaṭṭāriyyah* order<sup>16</sup> – the laws of the Buton Kingdom which were adopted in the laws of the Buton Kingdom and the concept of the twenty attributes of God during the reign of Sultan Dayan Ihsanudin (1597-1631 AD). This information is stated in the agreement between the kingdom and the Dutch Colonial, represented by Pieter Both in 1613 AD. Among its contents is that the Buton Kingdom is free to carry out its government according to local customs. One of the meanings of local customs is the division of power, referred to as Undang-Undang Martabat Tujuh (The Law of Seven Dignities).

As for the position of this book in the sultanate of Buton, perhaps it could be one of the forerunners or sources of the manifestation of Martabat Tujuh in the constitution of the empire, apart from the book *Daqā’iq al-Ḥurūf* by Abdur Rauf al-

---

<sup>15</sup> Amrollah Hemmat, “From Transcendence to Immanence: Translating the Untranslatable,” *Asia Pacific Translation and Intercultural Studies* 10, no. 3 (September 2023): 222–43, <https://doi.org/10.1080/23306343.2023.2287873>.

<sup>16</sup> Pramono and Sudarmoko, “A Newly Discovered Manuscript: Second Version of Syarh Rubai of Hamzah Fansuri Written by Syamsuddin Al Sumatrani,” *Manuscripta Orientalia. International Journal for Oriental Manuscript Research* 27, no. 1 (2021): 65–77, <https://doi.org/10.31250/1238-5018-2021-27-1-65-77>.



Fanṣūrī (1693 AD) and the book *Siyar al-Sālikīn* by Abdus Samad al-Falimbānī (1789 M)<sup>17</sup> as these two sources are mentioned in the book by Sultan Muhammad Idrus – La Ode Muhammad Idrus Qaimuddin<sup>18</sup> – entitled *Rawḍah al-Ikhwān* which contains the teachings of *Martabat Tujuh*. Because Sultan Muhammad Idrus in Buton was a student and received the allegiance of the Khalwatiyah Samaniyah order from the author of this book,<sup>19</sup> Muhammad al-Makki, there is a possibility that Sultan Idrus himself or his son Muhammad Nuh as manuscript owner wrote this book.

To move beyond general historical associations, this study systematically compares the WWBMKBM manuscript with canonical Nusantara texts to highlight Makkī's "reconciliatory Wujūdiyyah". Diverging from Hamzah Fansuri's pantheistic "ocean and wave" metaphors, Makkī employs the concept of *ẓill* (shadow) to internalize the *Martabat Tujuh* cosmology within the *sālik*'s anatomy by viewing the spirit as the shadow of the Essence. This approach echoes Abdurrauf Singkel's caution by distinguishing the Absolute Essence (*Allāh*) from the creative command (*Ilāh*), thus bridging mystical depth with ontological safety. Although biographical details regarding Makkī remain

---

<sup>17</sup> These two figures, through their works, tried to harmonize the practice of *syarī'ah* and *ṭarīqah* so that it could be understood more easily by the community. For more information about these two figures. See Ridwan Arif and Fuad Mahbub Siraj, "Shaykh 'Abd al-Ra'ūf al-Fanṣūrī (1615-1693 CE): A Study of His Contribution to the Development of Islamic Education in the Malay World," *Jurnal Akidah & Pemikiran Islam* 22, no. 2 (December 2020): 205–38, <https://doi.org/10.22452/afkar.vol22no2.6>; Dzulkifli Hadi Imawan, "The Intellectual Network of Shaykh Abdusshamad Al-Falimbani and His Contribution in Grounding Islam in Indonesian Archipelago at 18th Century AD," *Millah: Journal of Religious Studies*, December 31, 2018, 31–50, <https://doi.org/10.20885/millah.vol18.iss1.art3>.

<sup>18</sup> For information about the biography and works of Muhammad Idrus, see La Niampe, "La Ode Muhammad Idrus Qaimuddin Sastrawan Sufi Ternama Di Buton Abad XIX," *Humaniora* 22, no. 3 (2010): 250–65, <https://doi.org/10.22146/jh.1338>.

<sup>19</sup> Basrin Melamba and Muarifuddin, "Ijtihad of Sultan Muhammad Idrus Kaimuddin (18224-1851) in Buton, Southeast Sulawesi, Indonesia," *JICSA* 2, no. 1 (2013): 1–30, <https://doi.org/DOI:%2520https://doi.org/10.24252/jicsa.v2i1.765>.



obscure and suggest a possible Meccan origin despite the manuscript's discovery in Buton, this *mukhtaṣar* is critical for filling the gaps in nineteenth-century archipelago Sufism. Consequently, this research aims to analyze the text's mystical representations of nature, humanity, and divinity to elucidate its unique, localized discourse within the broader Sufi tradition.

## METHOD

This study adopts a qualitative research design with content analysis because this approach is the most suitable for examining metaphysical concepts embedded in a historical manuscript. Content analysis enables the researcher to systematically interpret symbolic expressions, ontological categories, and philosophical metaphors that characterize the WWBMKBM manuscript. The method is strengthened by philological procedures, which are essential for establishing textual authenticity and ensuring that the analysis is grounded in an accurate reconstruction of the manuscript.<sup>20</sup> This design is appropriate for answering the research question, which seeks to uncover how Muḥammad Makkī formulates Wujūdiyyah ontology and how his ideas relate to the broader Sufi discourse in the Nusantara intellectual tradition.<sup>21</sup>

The primary data consist of the WWBMKBM manuscript (DS 0010 00100), digitized from the private collection of La Ode Zaenu and accessed through the DREAMSEA repository. As a codex unicus, the manuscript represents the entire population of available textual data for this study. Inclusion criteria therefore focus on the legible core text written in Arabic without vowels, while exclusion criteria apply to damaged or unreadable portions, particularly the marginal commentary on folios 003v and 004v. Physical characteristics such as paper type, ink, script style, and page dimensions were documented to support the

---

<sup>20</sup> Charles F. Meyer, "Textual Analysis: From Philology to Corpus Linguistics," in *English Corpus Linguistics: Crossing Paths* (BRILL, 2012), 23–42, [https://doi.org/10.1163/9789401207935\\_004](https://doi.org/10.1163/9789401207935_004).

<sup>21</sup> Oman Fathurahman, *Filologi Indonesia: Teori Dan Metode* (Jakarta: Kencana, 2015), 69.

philological assessment. No additional manuscript copies were identified, which reinforces the importance of careful textual preservation and interpretation.

The analysis was conducted in several structured steps. First, the text was established by identifying its boundaries, describing its physical features, and transcribing the readable sections. Second, a deductive coding framework was applied to extract metaphysical terminology, which was then organized into three ontological domains: *Ilāhiyyat* for concepts related to the Divine Essence and Attributes, *Kawniyyāt* for cosmological processes such as *tajallī* and *ẓill*, and *Insāniyyāt* for anthropological elements including *rūḥ* and *qalb*. Third, the coded data were compared with canonical seventeenth-century Nusantara Sufi texts, specifically *Sharab al-ʿAshiqīn* and *Tanbīh al-Māshī*, to identify points of convergence and divergence. This triangulation enabled the researcher to isolate Muḥammad Makkī's distinctive philosophical contributions and to position his reconciliatory interpretation of Wujūdīyyah within the evolving intellectual landscape of the region.

## FINDING AND DISCUSSION

### Finding

#### The Manuscript of *Waḥdah al-Wujūd* and Muḥammad Makkī's Work

The author's name of this book is written on the very first page of the manuscript without any description of the copyist and when it was copied. No colophon on the last page explains when this manuscript was copied. It's just that it is also written on the first page that the owner of this manuscript is noted in a description that reads, "belongs to a lowly and weak person Muhammad Nuh son of a weak person Muhamad Idrus al-Buṭūnī, may Allah grant forgiveness, compassion, and cover the ugliness of the two people, amen." Muhamad Nuh is known as a founder of 'Zawīyah,' namely a place or building to spread the teachings of Sufism.<sup>22</sup> The year of his birth is unknown. However, Noah was

---

<sup>22</sup> Donald P. Little, "The Nature of Khānqāsh, Ribāt, and Zāwīyas under The Mamlūks," in *Islamic Studies Presented to Charles J. Adams*, 1st

titled ‘Kanepulu Bente,’ a title for officials in the Sultanate of Buton, and then an extension as the next sultan of Buton with the title Sultan Muhamad Umar Kaimudin IV or the 32nd Sultan of Buton in 1885-1906 AD replacing his uncle Muhamad Sahili or Sultan Kaimuddin III (1871 -885 AD) who was the brother of his father Sultan Muhamad ‘Īdrūs Qā’imuddīn I (served 1824-1851 AD).<sup>23</sup> If the copyist of this manuscript is assumed to have been its owner, the manuscript can be dated to the lifetime of Sultan Muhammad Umar or to the early 19th century AD.

The author of this book, as written on the first page, is Syekh Muhamad Makkī. If seen from the ratio of the place of origin, then the author comes from Mecca. His full name, which is the closest according to some literature, is Muhamad bin Shīt bin Muhamad bin Syīt Sunbul al-Makkī al-Syāfī‘ī. Information on the date of birth and death of Syekh Muhamad Makki has not been found; only the date of death of his father and a brief biography that can be found, namely 1304 H/1886 AD in the book *A’lām al-Makkiyyīn*,<sup>24</sup> but it is reported that Syekh Makki lived at the same time as Sultan Idrus and then pledged him to follow the ṭarīqah. As for the information in the book, only a few teachers from Syekh Shīt bin Muhamad Sunbul are mentioned, including Syekh Abdurahman Surur, Syekh Muhamad Shaṭā, and Syekh Ahmad Dimyati. The people of Butonese then called him Syekh Mancuana because he came when he was old. Syekh Muhamad Makkī was a follower of the teachings of Syekh Muhamad bin Abdul Karim al-Sammānī (1776 AD) from

---

ed., ed. Wael B. Hallaq and Donald P. Little (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1991), 91–106; Ajid Thohir, “Sufi Tradition and the Establishment of Islamic Culture,” *Tawarikh: Journal of Historical Studies* 8, no. 1 (2016): 31–44, <https://doi.org/10.2121/tawarikh.v8i1.717>.

<sup>23</sup> A.M. Zahari, *Sejarah Dan Adat Fiy Darul Butuni (Buton) III* (Jakarta: Direktorat Jenderal kebudayaan, Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 1977), 76; Syarifuddin Nanti and Ahmad M. Sewang, “Pendidikan Islam Di Zawiyah Pada Masa Kesultanan Buton Abad Ke-19,” *Jurnal Diskursus Islam* 06, no. 3 (2018): 538–61, <https://doi.org/10.24252/jdi.v6i3.6550>.

<sup>24</sup> Abdullāh b. Abdurrahmān Al-Mu’allimī, *A’lām Al-Makkiyyīn*, 1st ed. (Madinah: Mu’assasah al-Furqān, 2000), 527.

Medina who was also a teacher of Abdus Samad al-Falimbānī who led the Ṭarīqah Samaniyah Khalwatiyah.<sup>25</sup>



Source: <https://www.hmmcloud.org/dreamsea/detail.php?msid=120>

**Figure 1**

*First page of Waḥdah Al-Wujūd Fī Bayān Al-Ma'rifah  
Min Kull Bayān Al-Muhaqqiqīn*

As follows figure 1, the first page of the manuscript is inscribed with several sentences, namely the book's title and the author's name, written in 7 lines in the form of an inverted triangle at the top right of the page. Beneath it is written the words الله (Allāh) and انا (Ana), which are written in relatively large sizes. Under the pronunciation, a description contains several Syekh's opinions about God's actions when he loves his servant. On the left side of the page, there is also some information, namely the Prophet's Ḥadīṣ about the Black Stone, an explanation about the spirit of the Prophet Muhammad, the meaning of the sentence 'Huwallāh,' and the opinion at the

<sup>25</sup> Muhammad Khalil Al-Murādī, *Silk Al-Durar* (Beirut: Dār Ibn Ḥazm, 1988), 4/60; Martin Van Bruinessen, "The Origins and Development of Sufi Orders (Tarekat) in Southeast Asia," *Studia Islamika* 1, no. 1 (1994): 1–23.

bottom row is the opinion of the Syekhs about the meaning of sincerity. At the bottom left is a collection of several writings that cannot be read correctly due to damage to the manuscript.

This book has at least six chapters and starts with bismillah sentences. The first chapter contains praise to Allah, congratulations on the Prophet Muhammad, and an explanation of the purpose of writing this book, namely conveying the knowledge of Sufism and how to follow the right path according to the paths of the prophets, saints and chosen people through the teachings of Syekh ‘Abd al-Qādir al-Jaylānī (1166 AD) order, followed by an explanation of the meaning of the spirit, body, and heart at every level of shari‘ah, tariqah, haqiqah and ma‘rifah. The second chapter explains how a person can know his God and explains the relationship between God, the spirit, the external (*ẓāhir*), and the internal (*bāṭin*). The third chapter describes the interpretation of the two creed sentences, especially the word *lā ilāh ’illā Allāh*. The fourth chapter describes the beginning of the creation of the spirits of beings. The fifth chapter tells the various kinds of human beings. Between the fifth and sixth chapters, there are several splinter explanations, namely the narrative of the words of Ali bin Abi Talib about how someone who wants to see Allah in his dreams and some practices at night. It is also stated in a line at the top of the final page that says, “This treatise is called *Zād al-Muttaqīn* by Maulana Syekh Abdus Samad al-Falimbānī.” It seems that the sixth chapter on this last page (006v) is The initial part of Syekh Abdus Samad’s treatise, along with other contents, may be found on pages that have been lost from this manuscript, which contain the teachings of his teacher, Muhammad bin Abdul Karim Saman, as mentioned above. This discourse explains the concept of *fanā’* (annihilation) in the teachings of *waḥdah al-wujūd*.

## Discussion

### Imagery of Nature in the *Waḥdah al-Wujūd* Manuscript

The WWBMKBM manuscript first explains the ontological contradiction between God and the universe, as this concept is one of the concepts in the idea of *waḥdah al-wujūd* (unification of being), which says that God’s manifestation (*tajallī*)

includes the disclosure of all-natural existence.<sup>26</sup> This contradiction is vertical and horizontal, as described in the Qur'an: Allah is the Most Inner and the Most Zahir, the One but also the Most Many, the Foremost and the Most Renewal, and so on.<sup>27</sup> The meaning of contradiction in this text is described as having sequential interrelatedness. For example, in the second chapter, it is stated that God stands by himself, and the Spirit stands because of God, which appears to stand because of something inner, just as nature stands because it is with God. The author bases this on the verse of the Koran, which reads, "God is the creator of all things." Moreover, what is even more interesting is the mention in this chapter of the 'magnetic' relationship between body, heart, soul or spirit, and *sirr* (secret of the heart). The magnet of the body is the act of Allah, the magnet of the heart is the name of Allah, the spirit's magnet is Allah's attribute, and the *sirr*'s magnet is Allah's essence. Magnets in the Sufi tradition can be interpreted as an affinity, which has an attraction and attracts its elements. It is this power of affinity that unites the entire universe. Magnetism in this context refers to magnetism that can be developed through spiritual practices such as meditation and remembrance.<sup>28</sup>

### Adam as *Imago Dei*

Apart from the *wujūdiyyah* ideology adhered to by Syekh Makkī, in the introductory chapter, he recommends being aware of the meanings of mystical terms at the level of *sharī'ah*, *ṭarīqah*, *ḥaqīqah*, and *ma'rifah*. Starting from the name Adam,

---

<sup>26</sup> Bambang Irawan, Ismail Fahmi Arrauf Nasution, and Hywel Coleman, "Applying Ibn 'Arabī's Concept of Tajallī: A Sufi Approach to Environmental Ethics," *Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism* 10, no. 1 (April 2021): 21–36, <https://doi.org/10.21580/tos.v10i1.7204>.

<sup>27</sup> Ghazi Ghazi, "Wahdat Al-Wujūd 'Abd al-Karīm al-Jilī," *Teosofi: Jurnal Tasawuf Dan Pemikiran Islam* 3, no. 1 (October 2015): 1–18, <https://doi.org/10.15642/teosofi.2013.3.1.1-18>.

<sup>28</sup> Mehrdad Massoudi, "On the Qualities of a Teacher and a Student: An Eastern Perspective Based on Buddhism, Vedanta and Sufism," *Inter-cultural Education* 13, no. 2 (2002): 137–55, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14675980220128979>.

while quoting a vow based on the Prophet Muhammad's answer to Usman's question, Adam in *sharī'ah* is Adam, in *ṭarīqah* is *al-a'yān al-thābitah* (permanent archetypes), in *ḥaqīqah* is the pronunciation of '*kuntu kanzan*' (I am a treasure), in *ṭarīqah* is the pronunciation of '*makhfiyyan*' (the hidden one). In *ma'rifah* it is pronounced '*lā huwa illā anā lā ghayr walā ayna illāllāh ka'annahū huw huw.*' Adam, in the concept of *wujūdiyyah* refers to the relationship between God and humans, as well as humans and nature. In Ibn Arabi's view, when Allah manifests nature, nature is still a misty shadow without a soul and looks like a mirror that has no flash; that is, it is not visible that is a manifestation of the majesty of God's Names, Attributes and Oneness. Then by His decree, He 'breathed' the divine spirit into the body of nature, which is likened to a mirror, as a preparation for that image to receive the eternal and holy divine overflow so that the mirror may shine. Adam represents the essence and spirit of this mirror.<sup>29</sup>

In the context of this meaning, there is a Sufi expression that says that Allah created Adam in His image (*Imago Dei*), and this is one of the so-called *tasybīh* (God's likeness to man). In this stratum, humans are the most perfect beings, namely *Insan Kamil*. In other words, the Perfect Man is the ideal summary of the universe, the essence of the spirit of the realm of Being, a being in which all the elements that are incarnated in the universe are collected and summarized; therefore, human beings are a Microcosm (Small Realm). In another stratum, the universe is the Great Man (*Insān Kabīr*), namely the Macrocosm, which is the first thing God created to witness Himself.<sup>30</sup> The most important feature of this Macrocosm is that each being in it represents

---

<sup>29</sup> Michael Sells, "Ibn 'Arabi's Polished Mirror: Perspective Shift and Meaning Event," *Studia Islamica*, no. 67 (1988): 121–49, <https://doi.org/10.2307/1595976>; Javid Anwar Y. A. Javid Anwar Y. A., "Reflections in the Mirror: Reading Andrei Tarkovsky through the Mirror of Ibn Arabi," *The International Journal of the Image* 2, no. 4 (2013): 73–86, <https://doi.org/10.18848/2154-8560/CGP/v02i04/44061>.

<sup>30</sup> Pierre Lory, "Macrocosm and Microcosm in Sufi Thought," in *Sufi Cosmology* (BRILL, 2022), 234–49, [https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004392618\\_013](https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004392618_013).



a particular aspect (Asma) of Allah, and only one so that the whole thing lacks clear boundaries and clear articulation so that it becomes like a loose collection of separate points, i.e., like the foggy mirror shape as mentioned earlier.<sup>31</sup> At the end of the first chapter, Syekh Makkī reinforces the form of God's manifestation in the human being by quoting a vow based on a hadith qudsi. This hadith is also cited in *Sirr al-Asrār* by Syekh 'Abd al-Qādir al-Jaylānī and reads, "Man is My sirr, and I am his sirr."

As for the sequence delivered by Syekh Makkī, it can be interpreted that Adam at the level of the meaning of *sharī'ah* is Adam as a prophet sent to Earth, the form of which has become a biological human. Then, at *ṭarīqah* level, there are permanent archetypes which, in terms of the *wujūdīyah*, are defined as something that has the potential to exist and which is the core of everything that exists and whose knowledge is only in God. As this universe has existence, it is not an absolute existence but a 'relative existence' (*wujūd idāfī*). This existence has been defined and limited in various ways and forms. However, this relative existence is reflected in the mirror of absolute Existence in the context of the mirror metaphor, as previously explained. But the image in the mirror is not the object itself but represents it. So, in this sense, the universe reveals the secret (*sirr*) of the Absolute. The word 'secret' means the 'hidden' depth of Existence, which is in line with the phrase '*kanzān makhfiyyan*' which is a redacted hadith *qudsī*, "I am a hidden treasure, and I desire (love) to be known. Thus, I created all of the creations, and in that way, I could be known by them. And then they know me."<sup>32</sup>

Through this phrase, Syekh Makkī provides an order of levels of *ṭarīqah* and *ḥaqīqah* which can be interpreted as a rhyme interpretant that humans who are also part of nature reflect God on Earth or can be said to be *khalīfah fī al-arḍ* (God's

---

<sup>31</sup> Shabana Nazar, Najamul Hassan, and Badshah Rehman, "The Philosophy and Ontology of Ibn Arabi in Context of Islam and Sufism," *Palarch's Journal of Archaeology If Egypt* 18, no. 10 (2021): 2509–20.

<sup>32</sup> Mohamed Haj Yousef, *Ibn 'Arabi - Time and Cosmology* (New York: Routledge, 2008), 125.

representative on earth).<sup>33</sup> And in the last stratum, Syekh Makkī explained the meaning of Adam in *ma'rifah* as God's *tanzīh*, namely through the sentence "there is no He but Me, no one else and nothing but Allah as He is He. That is the mediating sentence between *tasybīh* (similarity) and *tanzīh* (disregarding) which negates (*nafy*) and affirms (*isbāt*). Negation (there is no God) and affirmation (except Allah), negation is directed at various divine attributes, namely whatever is made a god, with something contained in the cosmos. And because everything that exists in the cosmos is a sign of God which represents something of the divine nature, so negation is directed through everything (the other/*ghayr*).<sup>34</sup> The He-ness (*huwa*) of God is Substance (essence or that which is marked by the mention of Him as in the Qur'an "*huwa al-awwal wa al-ākhir*."

In the second chapter, the word '*zill*' also appears, which means shadow, as a figurative word that connects the four existences above. It is said that *sir* (secrecy), *rūh* (spirit), *qalb* (heart), *jism* (body), *ḥarakah* (movement), and *sukūn* (stillness) are the shadow of God's *wujūd* (entity), *zāt* (substance), *ṣifāt* (attributes), *asmā'* (names), and *aḥwāl* (deeds). In the emanation philosophy of al-Suhrawardī (1191 AD) and Plato (347 BC), the word 'shadow' describes the physical world. The perfect form of this nature is light itself, and al-Suhrawardī named it 'light of light' or penumbra. This shadow in Persian is called 'Itsthmuses,' which means 'Barzakh' an emanation of light which he called the 'First Light.' The First Light pours out the second light, namely the heavenly mass and the physical compounds or elements that make up the physical world.<sup>35</sup> So the eight

---

<sup>33</sup> Aulia Rakhmat, "Islamic Ecotheology: Understanding the Concept of Kalifah and the Ethical Responsibility of the Environment," *Academic Journal of Islamic Principles and Philosophy* 3, no. 1 (June 2022): 1–24, <https://doi.org/10.22515/ajipp.v3i1.5104>.

<sup>34</sup> Ahmad Sururi, Arqom Kuswanjono, and Agus Himmawan Utomo, "Ecological Sufism Concepts in the Thought of Seyyed Hossein Nasr," *Research, Society and Development* 9, no. 10 (2020): e5769108611, <https://doi.org/10.33448/rsd-v9i10.8611>.

<sup>35</sup> Muhammad Obaidullah, "Philosophical Sufism: An Analysis of Suhrawardi's Contribution with Special Reference to His School of

elements that are connected can be interpreted as meaning that every human being has a physical form that is within him, and at the same time, there is an astral form, and if we repeat it, the secrecy in humans has an astral form which is an emanation from the entity of God, the spirit is an emanation from the substance of God, the heart is an emanation of His attributes, body is an emanation of His names, while a person's stillness and movement are form of emanation of His deeds.

Syekh Makkī based the outpouring of shadows on the verse “How He widens the shadows.” According to Syekh Makkī, the four essences within oneself and the four other essences that exist in the divine dimension are tools a person can use to know their God because, based on the hadith, “whoever knows himself knows his God.” Hamzah Fansuri also quoted this hadith in his poetry, as well as in the poetry and book of Abdur Rauf Singkel *Tanbīh al-Māsyī*, which later became the argument for each of these Sufis in explaining waḥdah al-wujūd. Hamzah Fansuri tends to establish God's immanence over his servants, which means that a person can know God in essence if he knows his essence. Meanwhile, Abdur Rauf tends to determine the transcendence of God so that a person cannot see the nature of God, but what is meant by knowing God is that he knows himself as a weak and lowly person and then thereby knows God, the Almighty and the Most Glorious. According to Abdur Rauf, to see the nature of the *Haqq*, a *sālik* must know that he is a person who is ‘*ajz*’ (weak) and develops the character of *ḥayrah* (confused).<sup>36</sup> So, it can be said that Syekh Makkī's position between the two scholars is more inclined towards Fansuri's understanding but with differences in the concept of how a person gains knowledge of the nature of God through 8 contradictory but interconnected essences.

---

Illumination (Ishraqi),” *Afkār* 16 (2015): 119–42; Milad Milani, “Mysticism in the Islamicate World: The Question of Neoplatonic Influence in Sufi Thought,” in *Later Platonists and Their Heirs among Christians, Jews, and Muslims* (BRILL, 2022), 513–44, [https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004527850\\_023](https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004527850_023).

<sup>36</sup> Fathurahman, *Tanbīh Al-Māsyī: Menyoal Wahdatul Wujud Kasus Abdurrauf Singkel Di Aceh Abad 17*, 21.

## Ocean and Wine Symbolism

At the end of the chapter, Syekh Makkī stated that one cannot taste the drink of the monotheists except after being immersed in an ocean of contemplation. This sentence has two figurative words; the first is ‘the drink of the monotheists’ (*masyrab ahli al-tawḥīd*) and ‘ocean of contemplation’ (*baḥr al-fikr*);

*Lā tadhūqu mashrab ahl al-tawḥīd illā ba‘da mā  
taghammasat fī baḥr al-fikr thalāth marrāt aw sab‘  
marrāt.*

cannot taste the drink of the monotheists except after being immersed in an ocean of contemplation.

This monotheistic drink may have the same meaning as the name of a book by Hamzah Fansuri *Syarab al-‘Āsyiqīn*, which means a glass of lovers. In the Sufi tradition, names with romantic nuances from monotheists, such as lovers, yearns, drunkards, etc., are understandable. Meanwhile, according to Hamzah Fansuri, the meaning of the drink for lovers can be interpreted as a person’s awareness and knowledge of the *syarī‘ah*, *ṭarīqah*, *ḥaqīqah*, knowledge of God and His nature, and understanding of love and gratitude.<sup>37</sup> So, some of these parts were explained by Syekh Makkī earlier as the ‘drink’ of monotheists. ‘*Masyrab*’ may also refer to the wine that intoxicates lovers as symbolized in the poem by Ibn al-Fāriḍ (1235 AD) who is called the King of Lovers:

*Syaribnā ‘alā zikr al-ḥabīb mudāmah  
Sakirnā biḥā min qabl an yukhlaq al-karm.*

I drink wine while saying the name of my lover

---

<sup>37</sup> Yusri Mohamad Ramli, Mohd Syukri Yeoh Abdullah, and Rohaimi Rastam, “Ma’rifatullah Menurut Shaykh Hamzah Fansuri,” *Jurnal Antara-bangsa Alam Dan Tamadun Melayu* 4 (2016): 41–47, <https://doi.org/10.17576/IMAN-2016-0403-04>; M. Ahsin and M. Alfatih Suryadilaga, “Interpretasi Sufistik Atas Hadis Melalui Sastra Dalam Syair Perahu Karya Hamzah Fansuri,” *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur’an Dan Hadis* 21, no. 1 (January 2020): 193–216, <https://doi.org/10.14421/qh.2020.2101-10>.

He made me drunk even before the wine was created.<sup>38</sup>

The commentators of this poem say that the lover is He who is the Highest; wine means the drink of divine love that appears because of witnessing the beautiful names belonging to the Supreme Presence and then makes a seeker drown in pleasure and happiness because he is detached from anything other than the essence.<sup>39</sup>

The word *baḥr* (ocean) in the Sufi tradition can represent God's knowledge or knowledge and his divine secrets. The sea provides a mystical dimension for Sufis to gain inner experience. Mahdavi argues that the sea is single but has various entities, such as steam, rain, clouds, bubbles, and waves that emanate from beings. In a poem, Ibn Arabi uses the symbols of the darkness of the ocean, wind, and coast to hint at God's self-disclosure for connoisseurs of knowledge.<sup>40</sup> Not much different from Fansuri, who often uses the sea and waves as a symbol of God's relationship with nature, he said in his book *al-Muntahī*, "The sea is the former; when it rumbles, the name of the wave is said, but in essence, it is also the sea, because the sea and the waves are one and none two."<sup>41</sup> The sea symbolizes the Supreme God who was before His existence, and the waves are the universe that emerged because of the existence of the former. Both look different, but they are still seas. Through the ocean, Fansuri also describes the encounter between a servant and God in himself, and the depths of the sea indicate the place of origin where there

<sup>38</sup> Ibn Al-Fāriḍ, *Dīwān Ibn Al-Fāriḍ* (Beirut: Dār Ṣādir, n.d.), 120.

<sup>39</sup> Ferguenis Riyāḍ and Farīdah Mawlā, "Dilālah Ram Zal-Khamrah Fī al-Syī'r al-Šūfī (Ibn al-Fāriḍ Unmūzajan)," *Al-Khiṭāb* 17, no. 2 (2022): 477–502; Merry Choironi and Ida Nursida, "Unveil The Meaning of Ibn Al-Farid's Sufistic Poetry Using the Riffaterre's Semiotics," *ARABIYAT: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Arab Dan Kebahasaaraban* 7, no. 2 (2020): 235–50, <https://doi.org/10.15408/a.v7i2.18115>.

<sup>40</sup> B. Mahdavi, "The Role of Allegory and Symbol in Expressing the Fixed Entities in Araghi and Ibn-e-Arabi's View," *Journal of History Culture and Art Research* 6, no. 1 (2017): 817–814. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.7596/taksad.v6i1.786>.

<sup>41</sup> Al-Attas, *The Mysticism of Hamzah Fansuri*, 791.

is an infinite distance between them.<sup>42</sup> This word also can stand on Carl G. Jung's view (1961), he argued that the dark sea is a symbol of self-transformation in Islam; he proved this by the existence of the legend of the Prophet Khidr in the story of the Al-Quran surah Al-Kahf. In his view, Khidr is the incarnation of the fish belonging to Moses, which was lost in the sea, and then from the sea, the fish transforms into Khidr, a symbol of the eternal self.<sup>43</sup> Likewise, the Javanese Islamic mystical legend makes the depths of the ocean a meeting place between Bima and Dewa Ruci to find out the *sangkan paraning dumadi* (origin and purpose of creation), which then, after that meeting, Bima transforms into a perfect warrior.<sup>44</sup> Concerning Syekh Makkī's statement, the ocean of contemplation as a rheme interpretant may refer to the concepts discussed above or to a place of seclusion, corresponding to the *ṭarīqah* he adheres to, namely Khalwatiyah, which emphasizes seclusion. Within this setting, the seeker contemplates the eight essences in order to attain knowledge of the nature of God. When he comes out of his solitude, he transforms into a more perfect self.

Syekh Makkī explains ontologically mystically the creation of Nūr Muḥamad (the Light of Muḥamad) as the beginning of the creation of the elements in the universe. He said that when God wanted to create the soul of the Prophet Muḥammad, He manifested His majesty and beauty, then Muḥammad's Light appeared like the appearance of fire from iron and stone, then the two great and beautiful qualities collided with each other so that

---

<sup>42</sup> Mazlina Parman and Nurazmallail Marni, "Sufi Symbols in Poems of Ibn 'Arabi and Hamzah Fansuri," *International Journal of Islamic and Civilizational Studies* 8, no. 2 (2021): 21–38, <https://doi.org/10.11113/umran.2021.8n2.498>.

<sup>43</sup> Felicia A. Norton and Charles H. Smith, "Intimacy with the Earth," *Jung Journal* 9, no. 4 (2015): 58–75, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/19342039.2015.1086936>.

<sup>44</sup> Ngatmin Abbas et al., "Cosmology of Dewa Ruci in the Islamic Tasawuf Perspective," *Amorti: Jurnal Studi Islam Interdisipliner* 3, no. 2 (May 2024): 62–70, <https://doi.org/10.59944/amorti.v3i2.286>; Asmaun Sahlan and Ach. Fatchan, "Collaboration Sufism Islamic and Adherents Javanese in the Story Puppet of Dewaruci in Java Indonesia," *The Social Sciences* 11, no. 21 (2016): 5211–17.

Nūr Muhamad appeared. After that, when Allah had the will to create all souls, He looked at the Light with a look full of power and fear. Then the Light was afraid because of that noble sight and bead dripping beads of sweat. Furthermore, from the drops of sweat, the souls of the *Ulū al-ʿAzm* were made, then the spirits of the Muslims, the spirits of the prophets, the saints, the gnostic experts, and the souls of the martyrs. He then created the spirits of angels, believers, spirits of the jinn, spirits of disbelievers, demons, animals, and plants. After all, Allah created the elements, namely fire, air, earth, and water. As for fire, it represents the name of the Conqueror, air is the name of the Noble One, water is the name of the Living, and earth is the name of the Wise.

Syekh Makkī continued his explanation about the existence of embodiments when these elements meet each other. When fire meets water, a thick fog will appear, becoming the heavens and the earth, and a dense fog will appear, becoming the *ʿArasy*, *Kursī*, *Lawḥ*, *Kalām*, Hell, and Heaven. Furthermore, Syekh Makkī explained the destruction of each element because of the other elements. If the fire is mixed with mud, the mud will be destroyed; if the fire is mixed with water, the fire will be destroyed.

*Fa'in nabat al-nār bi al-ḥīn fasadat al-ḥīn wa al-nār bi al-mā' fasadat al-nār wa al-mā' bi al-rīḥ fasadat al-mā' wa al-rīḥ bi al-rūḥ fasadat al-rīḥ wa al-rūḥ billāh subḥānahū wa ta'ālā fasadat al-rūḥ. Qāla ta'ālā kull shay' ḥālik 'illā wajjahū.*

If water is mixed with air, the water will be destroyed; when air (*rīḥ*) meets the spirit (*rūḥ*), the air will be destroyed, and when the spirit meets Allah, the spirit will be destroyed, so all that remains is Allah, the Most Eternal as His words, “all that perish except Allah.

Moreover, once again, Syekh Makkī provides a classification and stratum of each creation as an existence with a gross (physical) dimension and a latitude (astral) dimension related to Latent One. This concept also cannot be separated from the doctrine of the unity of being in which the gross form of all the



elements of this universe, both within humans and outside them, is the overflowing form or manifestation of the divine elements.

### **Ontological Hierarchy and the Status of *A'yān Thābitah***

Moving beyond the cultural symbolism of the Nusantara, the WWBMKBM manuscript presents a rigorous engagement with post-Avicennian ontology,<sup>45</sup> specifically in articulating the gradation of being (*tashkīk al-wujūd*). Makkī does not merely describe the unity of being as a poetic sentiment but constructs a metaphysical hierarchy where the existence of the cosmos is defined by its contingency. This is evident in his unique treatment of *a'yān thābitah* (permanent archetypes). Makkī reinterprets the prophetic tradition regarding “Adam” through a four-fold epistemological structure: while Adam in *sharī'ah* refers to the biological progenitor, in *ṭarīqah*, Adam is identified as *al-a'yān al-thābitah*. This categorization elevates the human prototype from a physical entity to a pre-eternal fixed essence in Divine Knowledge, bridging the gap between the Absolute Essence (*Ḥaqīqah/Kuntu Kanzan*) and the sensible world.

Furthermore, Makkī clarifies the concept of *wujūd 'idāfī* (relative or extra existence) through a distinctive cosmology of “annihilation” (*fanā*). Unlike the static emanations found in earlier texts, Makkī describes a dynamic ontological absorption: “*If water is mixed with air... the water will be destroyed... and*

---

<sup>45</sup> Post-Avicennian ontology refers to the major philosophical shift in the Islamic world—primarily after the 12th century—that moved from the essentialist metaphysics of Ibn Sīnā (Avicenna) to an existentialist framework centered on the Primacy of Being (*aṣālah al-wujūd*). In this tradition, ‘existence’ is not merely a predicate of things, but the sole underlying reality, while the created universe serves as a locus of manifestation (*tajallī*). This framework introduces the concept of *tashkīk al-wujūd* (gradation of being), which posits that reality is a single spectrum varying in intensity—like light and shadow—rather than distinct categories. Musa Alkadzim, “The Ontological Capture of Reason and Revelation: Toward A Synthesizing Approach of Ibn ‘Arabī and Mullā Ṣadrā,” *Kanz Philosophia: A Journal for Islamic Philosophy and Mysticism* 9, no. 2 (December 2023), <https://doi.org/10.20871/kpjipm.v9i2.272>; Mehdi Amin Razavi, “How Ibn Sinian Is Suhrawardi’s Theory of Knowledge?,” *Philosophy East and West* 53, no. 2 (April 2003): 203–14, <https://doi.org/10.1353/pew.2003.0010>.

*when the spirit meets Allah, the spirit will be destroyed, so all that remains is Allah.*” This passage philosophically demonstrates that created beings possess no intrinsic reality; their existence is strictly relational. The elements (water, fire, air) and even the Spirit (*Rūḥ*) serve as ontological barriers that must be transcended.

Thus, the concept of *ẓill al-wujūd* (shadow of existence) in this manuscript is not merely a metaphor for resemblance, but a definition of ontological dependence. The “shadow” implies that the universe is a *tajallī* (manifestation) that has no independent footing. To comprehend this, Makkī argues that rational discourse is insufficient; it requires an “epistemological immersion.” As the text states, one *“cannot taste the drink of the monotheists except after being immersed in an ocean of contemplation.”* Here, Makkī synthesizes the intellectual rigor of Akbarian metaphysics with the experiential necessity of Nusantara Sufism, positioning human consciousness as the locus where the *shadow* realizes its origin in the Real.

Ultimately, Makkī anchors this abstract cosmology within the human microcosm, establishing a sophisticated theomorphic anthropology where every human faculty corresponds to a Divine reality. This is explicitly codified in the manuscript’s formulation: *“Al-Sirr ẓill al-wujūd... wa-al-badan ẓill al-’asmā’”* (The Secret is the shadow of Being... and the body is the shadow of the Names). Through this isomorphic mapping, Makkī argues that the human being is not merely a biological entity but the ultimate *locus* of Divine projection. The physical body is treated as the manifestation of God’s Names (*Asmā’*), the heart as the repository of Attributes (*Ṣifāt*), and the Spirit (*Rūḥ*) as the direct shadow of the Essence (*Dhāt*). By citing the Quranic verse *“kayfa madd al-ẓill”* (how He extends the shadow), Makkī legitimizes this mystical structure scripturally, asserting that human existence is the very “shadow” extended by the Absolute. Consequently, the journey of *ma’rifah* or *gnosis* in Makkī’s framework is not an external search but an inward navigation through these shadows, moving from the body’s actions known as *Af’āl* toward the deepest secret of the heart, the *Sirr*, in order to witness the Owner of the Shadow.

## CONCLUSION

This study demonstrates that the manuscript articulates a distinctive ontological vision in which nature, humanity, and the Divine are interconnected through a metaphysical structure of emanation. Natural elements such as water, fire, air, and earth are framed as astral reflections of divine names, and their interactions are believed to generate higher cosmological realities including the Throne, the Pen, Heaven, and Hell. This cosmology positions the natural world not as a passive backdrop but as an active manifestation of divine abundance, thereby grounding Makkī's mystical philosophy in a holistic understanding of existence.

The manuscript must also be understood within its historical and institutional context. As a text associated with the Samāniyyah Khalwatiyyah tradition and preserved within the Buton Sultanate, it functioned as both a spiritual guide and an intellectual instrument for shaping ethical and political life. Its emphasis on the sequential cultivation of *sharī'ah*, *ṭarīqah*, *ḥaqīqah*, and *ma'rifah* reflects a pedagogical model aimed at forming the Perfect Man, while its resonance with the doctrine of *Martabat Tujuh* suggests its role in reinforcing the kingdom's metaphysical foundations. More broadly, the manuscript conveys an implicit call for self-knowledge and ecological awareness, proposing that harmony between God, humans, and nature is essential because nature itself is a locus of divine manifestation.

Despite these contributions, the study is constrained by the manuscript's historical specificity and the interpretive challenges inherent in mystical texts. The cultural setting of nineteenth-century Buton may limit the direct applicability of its insights to contemporary ecological or philosophical debates, and the focus on selected Sufi concepts may overlook other intellectual currents that shaped the region's metaphysical discourse. Moreover, the subjective nature of interpreting symbolic language invites alternative readings that could yield different conclusions about the nature of existence and human responsibility.

Overall, the WWBMKBM manuscript represents a significant development in the trajectory of Nusantara Sufism. It marks a transition from the polemical debates of seventeenth-century

Aceh toward a more reconciliatory formulation of Wujūdiyyah in nineteenth-century Buton. Through the metaphor of *ẓill al-wujūd* (shadow of existence), Muḥammad Makkī offers a nuanced synthesis that preserves the depth of Akbarian metaphysics while aligning it with the boundaries of Islamic orthodoxy. This study therefore highlights the active role of Southeast Asian scholars in shaping post-Avicennian ontology and challenges assumptions that intellectual innovation flowed only from the Arab heartlands. The manuscript stands as evidence of a sophisticated theomorphic anthropology in maritime Southeast Asia, one that views the human being not as distant from the Divine but as the most refined shadow of His Essence.

## REFERENCES

### Books

- Al-Attas, Syed Naquib. *The Mysticism of Hamzah Fansuri*. Kuala Lumpur: University of Malaysia Press, 1970.
- Al-Fāriḍ, Ibn. *Dīwān Ibn Al-Fāriḍ*. Beirut: Dār Ṣādir, n.d.
- Al-Mu'allimī, Abdullāh b. Abdurrahmān. *A'lām Al-Makkiyyīn*. 1st ed. Madinah: Mu'assasah al-Furqān, 2000.
- Al-Murādī, Muhammad Khalil. *Silk Al-Durar*. Beirut: Dār Ibn Ḥazm, 1988.
- Fathurahman, Oman. *Filologi Indonesia: Teori Dan Metode*. Jakarta: Kencana, 2015.
- . *Tanbīh Al-Māsyī: Menyoal Wahdatul Wujud Kasus Abdurrauf Singkel Di Aceh Abad 17*. Bandung: Mizan, 1999.
- Yousef, Mohamed Haj. *Ibn 'Arabi - Time and Cosmology*. New York: Routledge, 2008.
- Zahari, A.M. *Sejarah Dan Adat Fiy Darul Butuni (Buton) III*. Jakarta: Direktorat Jenderal kebudayaan, Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 1977.

## Journal Articles

- Abbas, Ngatmin, Sukari, Faruq Alhabsi, and Habib Assalam. "Cosmology of Dewa Ruci in the Islamic Tasawuf Perspective." *Amorti: Jurnal Studi Islam Interdisipliner* 3, no. 2 (May 2024): 62–70. <https://doi.org/10.59944/amorti.v3i2.286>.
- Afif Anshori, Muhammad. "Kontestasi Tasawuf Sunni Dan Tasawuf Falsafdi Di Nusantara." *Teosofi: Jurnal Tasawuf Dan Pemikiran Islam* 4, no. 2 (September 2014): 309–27. <https://doi.org/10.15642/teosofi.2014.4.2.309-327>.
- Ahsin, M., and M. Alfatih Suryadilaga. "Interpretasi Sufistik Atas Hadis Melalui Sastra Dalam Syair Perahu Karya Hamzah Fansuri." *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadis* 21, no. 1 (January 2020): 193–216. <https://doi.org/10.14421/qh.2020.2101-10>.
- Alkadzim, Musa. "The Ontological Capture of Reason and Revelation: Toward A Synthesizing Approach of Ibn 'Arabī and Mullā Ṣadrā." *Kanz Philosophia: A Journal for Islamic Philosophy and Mysticism* 9, no. 2 (December 2023). <https://doi.org/10.20871/kpjipm.v9i2.272>.
- Arif, Ridwan, and Fuad Mahbub Siraj. "Shaykh 'Abd al-Ra'ūf al-Fanṣūrī (1615-1693 CE): A Study of His Contribution to the Development of Islamic Education in the Malay World." *Jurnal Akidah & Pemikiran Islam* 22, no. 2 (December 2020): 205–38. <https://doi.org/10.22452/afkar.vol22no2.6>.
- Badaruddin, Faudzinain. "Tuhfah Al-Mursalat Ila Ruh al-Nabiy as the Source of the Doctrine Seven Grades of Being in the Malay-Indonesian Archipelago." *Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism* 10, no. 1 (April 2021): 59–74. <https://doi.org/10.21580/tos.v10i1.8580>.
- Bruinessen, Martin Van. "Studies of Sufism and the Sufi Orders in Indonesia." *Die Welt Des Islams* 38, no. 2 (1998): 192–219.
- . "The Origins and Development of Sufi Orders (Tarekat) in Southeast Asia." *Studia Islamika* 1, no. 1 (1994): 1–23.
- Choironi, Merry, and Ida Nursida. "Unveil The Meaning of Ibn Al-Farid's Sufistic Poetry Using the Riffaterre's Semiotics." *ARABIYAT: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Arab Dan Kebahasaan* 7, no. 2 (2020): 235–50. <https://doi.org/10.15408/a.v7i2.18115>.

- Ghozi, Ghozi. "Wahdat Al-Wujūd 'Abd al-Karīm al-Jīlī." *Teosofi: Jurnal Tasawuf Dan Pemikiran Islam* 3, no. 1 (October 2015): 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.15642/teosofi.2013.3.1.1-18>.
- Hemmat, Amrollah. "From Transcendence to Immanence: Translating the Untranslatable." *Asia Pacific Translation and Intercultural Studies* 10, no. 3 (September 2023): 222–43. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23306343.2023.2287873>.
- Imawan, Dzulkifli Hadi. "The Intellectual Network of Shaykh Abdusshamad Al-Falimbani and His Contribution in Grounding Islam in Indonesian Archipelago at 18th Century AD." *Millah: Journal of Religious Studies*, December 31, 2018, 31–50. <https://doi.org/10.20885/millah.vol18.iss1.art3>.
- Irawan, Bambang, Ismail Fahmi Arrauf Nasution, and Hywel Coleman. "Applying Ibn 'Arabī's Concept of Tajallī: A Sufi Approach to Environmental Ethics." *Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism* 10, no. 1 (April 2021): 21–36. <https://doi.org/10.21580/tos.v10i1.7204>.
- Javid Anwar Y. A, Javid Anwar Y. A. "Reflections in the Mirror: Reading Andrei Tarkovsky through the Mirror of Ibn Arabi." *The International Journal of the Image* 2, no. 4 (2013): 73–86. <https://doi.org/10.18848/2154-8560/CGP/v02i04/44061>.
- Little, Donald P. "The Nature of Khānqāsh, Ribāṭ, and Zāwīyas under The Mamlūks." In *Islamic Studies Presented to Charles J. Adams*, 1st ed., edited by Wael B. Hallaq and Donald P. Little, 91–106. Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1991.
- Lohlker, Rüdiger. "Wahdat Al-Wujūd as Post-Avicennian Thought: Comparing Writings on the Basmala by Ibn 'Arabī and 'Abd al-Karīm al-Jīlī." *Teosofi: Jurnal Tasawuf Dan Pemikiran Islam* 11, no. 2 (December 2021): 194–215. <https://doi.org/10.15642/teosofi.2021.11.2.194-215>.
- Lory, Pierre. "Macrocosm and Microcosm in Sufi Thought." In *Sufi Cosmology*, 234–49. BRILL, 2022. [https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004392618\\_013](https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004392618_013).
- Mahdavi, B. "The Role of Allegory and Symbol in Expressing the Fixed Entities in Araghi and Ibn-e-Arabi's View." *Journal of History Culture and Art Research* 6, no. 1 (2017): 817–814.
- Massoudi, Mehrdad. "On the Qualities of a Theacher and a Student: An Eastern Perspective Based on Buddhism, Vedanta and

- Sufism.” *Intercultural Education* 13, no. 2 (2002): 137–55. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14675980220128979>.
- Melamba, Basrin, and Muarifuddin. “Ijtihad of Sultan Muhammad Idrus Kaimuddin (18224-1851) in Buton, Southeast Sulawesi, Indonesia.” *JICSA* 2, no. 1 (2013): 1–30. <https://doi.org/DOI:%2520https://doi.org/10.24252/jicsa.v2i1.765>.
- Meyer, Charles F. “Textual Analysis: From Philology to Corpus Linguistics.” In *English Corpus Linguistics: Crossing Paths*, 23–42. BRILL, 2012. [https://doi.org/10.1163/9789401207935\\_004](https://doi.org/10.1163/9789401207935_004).
- Milani, Milad. “Mysticism in the Islamicate World: The Question of Neoplatonic Influence in Sufi Thought.” In *Later Platonists and Their Heirs among Christians, Jews, and Muslims*, 513–44. BRILL, 2022. [https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004527850\\_023](https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004527850_023).
- Miswari, Miswari, Abdul Aziz Dahlan, and Abdul Hadi W.M. “Ḥamzah Fanṣūrī’s Contextual Analogies: Wujūdiyya Teaching in Malay 16th Century.” *Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism* 11, no. 1 (June 2022): 103–22. <https://doi.org/10.21580/tos.v11i1.11243>.
- Nanti, Syarifuddin, and Ahmad M. Sewang. “Pendidikan Islam Di Zawiyah Pada Masa Kesultanan Buton Abad Ke-19.” *Jurnal Diskursus Islam* 06, no. 3 (2018): 538–61. <https://doi.org/10.24252/jdi.v6i3.6550>.
- Nasir, Mohamad Abdun. “Revisiting the Javanese Muslim Slametan: Islam, Local Tradition, Honor and Symbolic Communication.” *Al-Jami’ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* 57, no. 2 (December 2019): 329–58. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2019.572.329-358>.
- Nazar, Shabana, Najamul Hassan, and Badshah Rehman. “The Philosophy and Ontology of Ibn Arabi in Context of Islam and Sufism.” *Palarch’s Journal of Archaeology If Egypt* 18, no. 10 (2021): 2509–20.
- Niampe, La. “La Ode Muhammad Idrus Qaimuddin Sastrawan Sufi Ternama Di Buton Abad XIX.” *Humaniora* 22, no. 3 (2010): 250–65. <https://doi.org/10.22146/jh.1338>.
- Norton, Felicia A., and Charles H. Smith. “Intimacy with the Earth.” *Jung Journal* 9, no. 4 (2015): 58–75. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/19342039.2015.1086936>.



- Obaidullah, Muhammad. "Philosophical Sufism: An Analysis of Suhrawardi's Contribution with Special Reference to His School of Illumination (Ishraqi)." *Afkār* 16 (2015): 119–42.
- Parman, Mazlina, and Nurazmallail Marni. "Sufi Symbols in Poems of Ibn 'Arabi and Hamzah Fansuri." *International Journal of Islamic and Civilizational Studies* 8, no. 2 (2021): 21–38. <https://doi.org/10.11113/umran2021.8n2.498>.
- Peacock, A.C.S. "Arabic Manuscripts from Buton, Southeast Sulawesi, and the Literary Activities of Sultan Muḥammad 'Aydarūs (1824–1851)." *Journal of Islamic Manuscripts* 10, no. 1 (April 2019): 44–83. <https://doi.org/10.1163/1878464X-01001005>.
- Pinem, Masmedia. "Ajaran Martabat Tujuh Dalam Naskah Asrar Al-Khafī Karya Syaikh." *Jurnal Lektur Keagamaan* 10, no. 1 (2012): 121–46. <https://doi.org/10.31291/jlk.v10i1.174>.
- Pramono, and Sudarmoko. "A Newly Discovered Manuscript: Second Version of Syarh Rubai of Hamzah Fansuri Written by Syamsuddin Al Sumatrani." *Manuscripta Orientalia. International Journal for Oriental Manuscript Research* 27, no. 1 (2021): 65–77. <https://doi.org/10.31250/1238-5018-2021-27-1-65-77>.
- Purwanto, Muhammad Roy. "Acculturation among Local Wisdom, Law and Sufism in Forming Martabat Tujuh Enactment of Buton Sultanate." *International Journal of Humanities and Management Sciences* 4, no. 3 (2016): 288–92.
- Rakhmat, Aulia. "Islamic Ecotheology: Understanding the Concept of Kalifah and the Ethical Responsibility of the Environment." *Academic Journal of Islamic Principles and Philosophy* 3, no. 1 (June 2022): 1–24. <https://doi.org/10.22515/ajipp.v3i1.5104>.
- Ramli, Yusri Mohamad, Mohd Syukri Yeoh Abdullah, and Rohaimi Rastam. "Ma'rifatullah Menurut Shaykh Hamzah Fansuri." *Jurnal Antarabangsa Alam Dan Tamadun Melayu* 4 (2016): 41–47. <https://doi.org/10.17576/IMAN-2016-0403-04>.
- Razavi, Mehdi Amin. "How Ibn Sinian Is Suhrawardi's Theory of Knowledge?" *Philosophy East and West* 53, no. 2 (April 2003): 203–14. <https://doi.org/10.1353/pew.2003.0010>.
- Rivauzi, Ahmad. "Landasan Filosofis Pemikiran Tasawuf Abdurrauf Singkel Tentang Allah, Manusia, Dan Alam." *Jurnal Theologia*

- 28, no. 2 (February 2018): 299–328. [https://doi.org/ 10.21580/teo.2017.28.2.1451](https://doi.org/10.21580/teo.2017.28.2.1451).
- Riyāḍ, Ferguenis, and Farīdah Mawlā. “Dilālah Ram Zal-Khamrah Fī al-Syī’r al-Ṣūfī (Ibn al-Fāriḍ Unmūzajan).” *Al-Khiṭāb* 17, no. 2 (2022): 477–502.
- Riyadi, Muhammad Irfan. “Kontroversi Theosofi Islam Jawa Dalam Manuskrip Kapujanggan.” *Al-Tahrir: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 13, no. 1 (2013): 21–41. <https://doi.org/10.21154/al-tahrir.v13i1.5>.
- Rohmana, Jajang A. “Diskursus Tasawuf Nusantara Di Mekah: Respons Mukhtār ‘Aṭārid Al-Bughūrī Terhadap Ajaran Martabat Tujuh.” *Jurnal Lektur Keagamaan* 19, no. 1 (July 2021): 1–36. <https://doi.org/10.31291/jlka.v19i1.923>.
- Rozi, Syafwan. “Wacana Sufistik: Tasawuf Falsafi Di Nusasntara Abad XVII M: Analisis Historis Dan Filosofis.” *Islam Realitas: Journal of Islamic & Social Studies* 3, no. 2 (December 2017): 163–75. [https://doi.org/10.30983/islam\\_realitas.v3i2.405](https://doi.org/10.30983/islam_realitas.v3i2.405).
- Sahlan, Asmaun, and Ach. Fatchan. “Collaboration Sufism Islamic and Adherents Javanese in the Story Puppet of Dewaruci in Java Indonesia.” *The Social Sciences* 11, no. 21 (2016): 5211–17.
- Sells, Michael. “Ibn ‘Arabi’s Polished Mirror: Perspective Shift and Meaning Event.” *Studia Isamica*, no. 67 (1988): 121–49. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1595976>.
- Siraj, Fuad Mahbub, Ridwan Arif, M. Syadli, and Amril Amril. “The Existence and the Challenges of Sufi Literature in Indonesia.” *Jurnal Akidah & Pemikiran Islam* 24, no. 1 (June 2022): 243–70. <https://doi.org/10.22452/afkar.vol24no1.7>.
- Sururi, Ahmad, Arqom Kuswanjono, and Agus Himmawan Utomo. “Ecological Sufism Concepts in the Thought of Seyyed Hossein Nasr.” *Research, Society and Development* 9, no. 10 (2020): e5769108611. <https://doi.org/10.33448/rsd-v9i10.8611>.
- Thohir, Ajid. “Sufi Tradition and the Establishment of Islamic Culture.” *Tawarikh: Journal of Historical Studies* 8, no. 1 (2016): 31–44. <https://doi.org/10.2121/tawarikh.v8i1.717>.